

Minutes
West Lafayette Historic Preservation Commission
Morton Community Center
222 N. Chauncey Avenue
West Lafayette, IN 47906
March 14, 2017

The meeting was called to order at 6:01 pm by Vice President Arnold Sweet, who presided.

Present: Colby Bartlett, Peter Bunder, Susan Curtis, Shelley Lowenberg-DeBoer, Arnold Sweet, Kurt Wahl¹, Erik Carlson², Julia Zuchkov², Erin Britton³

Absent: Linda Martin, Kelly Busch, Chris Kulesza

Approval of February 7, 2017 HPC Minutes

There were no objections, additions, or deletions to the February 7, 2017 HPC minutes. The minutes were approved unanimously.

Approval of March 7, 2017 COA Minutes

Commissioner Curtis moved to approve the minutes on the condition that an addendum be added outlining the votes of the COA sub-committee. This motion was passed unanimously.

110 E. Stadium

Director Carlson explained that the home under consideration is under an order of work to be done by the insurance company of the owner of the property. The contractor of the property, C'Koh Andrew with Knox Services, was present. The petitioner requested a replacement of all except one slope of the roof, installation of vinyl siding to cover the existing asbestos and aluminum siding, and wrapping of the columns on the front porch with a wood grained aluminum coil. Kurt Wahl explained that the siding on the property does not appear to be original. Commissioner Curtis requested alternatives to the vinyl siding. Andrew explained that alternative options were explored but cost and maintenance concerns would make switching to James Hardie Fiber Cement Siding problematic. The current cost of the entire project is \$21,000 total whereas a switch to the James Hardie siding would cost \$20,207 for the siding alone. The vinyl siding is the more cost-effective and easy to maintain option.

Commissioner Bartlett stated that because the material is not original then it would be unreasonable to request that aluminum siding be replaced with wood.

¹ Non-voting advisor

² Non-voting city staff

³ Arrived 6:12 pm

Commissioner Britton requested that wood replace the asbestos and aluminum siding.

Commissioner Bartlett motioned to approve the COA application, Commissioner Bunder seconded.

The roll call vote:

Aye: Colby Bartlett, Peter Bunder, Susan Curtis, Shelley Lowenberg-DeBoer, Arnold Sweet

Nay: Erin Britton

The COA was approved 5-1.

130 W. Lutz

Tom Eismin, petitioner, was unable to attend the meeting.

Carlson reviewed the details of Eismin's COA application. Eismin is requesting to change the porch decking from painted plywood to treated lumber, replace the support posts, move gutter downspouts, cover the soffit and fascia with aluminum and vinyl, pour a new stoop, restore current decorative accents, replace the porch roof shingles to match the shingles on the roof of the home, and replace the windows on the first floor to match the windows on the second floor.

The commission amended several points on the application. It requested that that the replacement posts be square, not fluted, made of wood, and slightly larger than what is currently present. It also added the stipulation that the original depth of the eaves be maintained and that no part of the decorative accents would be removed.

Commissioner Bartlett moved to approve the application with the stipulations as noted, Commissioner Bunder seconded.

The roll call vote:

Aye: Colby Bartlett, Peter Bunder, Susan Curtis, Shelley Lowenberg-DeBoer, Arnold Sweet, Erin Britton

Nay:

The COA was approved 6-0.

616 Stadium

Dan Teder represents the petitioner, 605 E LLC, and discussed the early stages of a proposed building located on Block 10 of the New Chauncey Neighborhood Plan as adopted in 2013 by West Lafayette's Common Council. A portion of the proposed development would be in the New Chauncey Neighborhood and as such would require the approval of the Historic Preservation Commission before a plan development process would be able to move forward. Block 10 is bordered by Allen and Garfield on the east and west; and Evergreen and Stadium on the north and south. This is considered a high density, mixed use building in the New Chauncey Land Use Plan. Petitioners explained that their intention is to be mindful of the land use plan. Michael Snyder, representative from South Street Capital, explained his firm's interest in the

area. The firm currently owns two homes on Block 10. John Gately, BKL architect, referred the group to provided packets. The proposed building is five, four, and three stories. The building would not feel like a back entry building, the front doors would be entered from the streets. The proposal includes masonry veneer tied together with metal panel throughout the south side of the building. Each inset would have an attached, private balcony. There would be a garden area in front of each unit. The corner of Allen and Evergreen would be the main entry of the building for the residents. The proposal includes town-home-like units. If this development were to be approved, several properties in the historic district would need to be demolished. In order for this project to move forward, it would first require the approval of the Historic Preservation Committee.

The Committee will review the homes that would be affected by this development and discuss this project at April's HPC meeting.

Staff Report - Erik Carlson

The Development Department has been in the process of updating the HPC website with the intention of creating a more user-friendly interface. There should be a website update within the next several months.

Carlson reported the discovery of several discrepancies in the City's HPC Ordinance. He will continue his review and discuss his finding with the commission at the next meeting. Action may be required to amend the ordinance.

Commissioners discussed the process that needs to take place in order to expand the historic district. Meeting dates with the sub-committee will be discussed and released to the public.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Adjourn

Commissioner Curtis moved to adjourn. Commissioner Bunder seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 7:27 pm.

Kelly Busch, Secretary